

Lampert & O'Connor, P.C.

1750 K Street NW Suite 600 Washington, DC 20006

ORIGINAL

Kenneth R. Boley bolev@l-olaw.com

RECEIVED

Tel 202/887-6230 Fax 202/887-6231

VIA HAND DELIVERY--DRAFT

MAR 2 6 2003

March 26, 2003

FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY

EX PARTE

Marlene Dortch
Secretary
Federal Communications Commission
The Portals
TW-A325
445 12th Street, S W.
Washington, D.C. 20554

Re. Notice of Oral *Ex Parte* Presentations CC Docket Nos 01-337, 02-33, 98-10. 95-20

Dear Ms Dortch

On March 25, 2003, Dave Baker, Vice President for Law and Public Policy, EarthLink, Inc., and Mark O'Connor of Lampert & O'Connor, P.C., met with Matthew Brill, Senior Legal Advisor to Commissioner Abernathy. During the meeting, EarthLink discussed its positions previously filed in the above-referenced dockets. The parties also discussed EarthLink's exparre letter filed in the above-referenced proceedings on March 24, 2003, which explains the legal obstacles to the Commission using "regulatory parity" as a basis for decision in the Wireline Broadband proceeding. EarthLink explained that regulatory parity is not a substitute for public interest considerations. Ensuring continued ISP access to BOC networks would be entirely reasonable and would promote greater consumer welfare.

Maintaining Computer III access principles on BOCs would be reasonable because ISPs generally do not have access to the cable platform. ISPs (including EarthLink) substantially rely on BOC DSL services to deliver competitive broadband ISP services to consumers. Although BOCs trail cable in broadband market share, much of this is attributable to BOCs' prior business decisions to promote other broadband services instead of DSL. While EarthLink has suggested ways to streamline Computer III requirements, the marketplace for competitive sources of broadband transport is not yet sufficiently developed to substantially reduce or eliminate Computer III and Computer III non-discriminatory access requirements

EarthLink also explained how ISPs provide price competition and a range of competitive services that benefit consumers, as well as how consumer access to web content is best ensured through rules which ensure continued DSL access for ISPs EarthLink also questioned whether, in light of recent decisions, there is a compelling basis for BOC regulatory relief in the *Wireline*

Lampert & O'Connor, P.C.

Oral *Ex Parte* Notice – March 26, 2003 Page 2

Broadband proceeding

On the same day, the undersigned met with Jessica Rosenworcel, Legal Advisor to Commissioner Copps, to discuss EarthLink's position in the *Wireline Broadband* proceeding. The parties discussed the EarthLink *ex parte* letter filed March 24, 2003, explaining the legal obstacles to the Commission using "regulatory parity" as a basis for decision in this proceeding. In response to a question, EarthLink explained its concerns that wholesale DSL services were overpriced and referenced its October 2, 2002 *ex parte* in the proceeding dealing with Verizon's now-withdrawn Transmittal *No* 232 That document was also filed for the record in this proceeding (CC Dkt. 02-33) as an attachment to EarthLink's October 28, 2002 *exparre* notice. EarthLink also discussed and provided a copy of its March 19, 2003 *ex parte* letter in this proceeding (CC Dkt 02-33) rebutting SBC's argument that the realization of consumer benefits is independent of whether there is competition among DSL-based ISPs.

On the same day, Dave Baker and the undersigned met with Christopher Libertelli, Legal Advisor to Chairman Powell, to discuss the *Wireline Broadband* proceeding. The parties discussed the EarthLink *ex parte* letter filed March 24, 2003, explaining the legal obstacles to the Commission using "regulatory parity" as a basis for decision in this proceeding. EarthLink also discussed and provided a copy of its March 19, 2003 *ex parte* letter rebutting SBC's argument that the realization of consumer benefits is independent of whether there is competition among DSL-based ISPs EarthLink provided a copy of the attached document entitled "Recent Awards" Finally, the parties discussed the potential implications of a decision to attempt to regulate wholesale DSL service provided to independent ISPs under Title I of the Communications Act, including the possible curtailment of competition in the provision of broadband Internet access services.

Pursuant to Section 1.1206(b)(2) of the Commission's Rules, eight copies of this Notice are being provided to you for inclusion in the public record in the above-captioned proceedings. Should you have any questions, please contact me.

Kenneth R. Boldy
Counsel for EarthLink, Inc.

CC Matthew Brill
Jessica Rosenworcel
Christopher Libertelli



EarthLink'



August 2002



CNET.com

The source for computers
and technology."

April 2002



March 2002

Computing

October 2001 &
February 2000



June 4, 2001



March 2001

2002 Highest in Customer Satisfaction Among High-speed Internet Service Providers in a Tie and Highest in Customer Satisfaction Among Dial-Up Internet Service Providers.

J.D. Power and Associates — EarthLink has received the Highest Ranking in Customer Satisfaction Among Dial-up ISPs and bed in the ranking for Highest Customer Satisfaction Among High-Speed ISPs, according to J.D. Power and Associates 2002 Syndicated Internet Service Provider Residential Customer Saosfacoon StudySM.

"We are proud to have garnered these rankings in such a prestigious and customer-focuse study," said haren Gough, EarthLink's executive vice president of marketing. "J.D. Power an Associates has always defined he standard for excellence, and these rankings once agai demonstrate our communent to providing the very best Internet experience to our subscribers.

J.D. Power and Associates 2002 Syndicated Internet Service Provider Residential Customer Satisfaction StudySM. Studenducted among national and regional ISP's and based on 4.629 responses. www.idnower.com

2002 CNET Editors' Choice Award— Citing EarthLink's (Nasdaq: ELNK) "cool tools an reliability," CNET for the third consecutive year has awarded rop honors to EarthLink in it annual review of Internet service providers (ISP).

In an article titled Dialing for dollars: we compare five major dial-up ISPs, CNET writes. EarthLink gets our nod as the best among the major dial-up ISPs. Why? The service help you get started then steps numbly out of the way. It offers ear:-iouse tools and doesn't peste you with ads or spam. And, io top 11 off, EarthLink provides highly reliable service and surprisingly p o d support for a reasonable \$22 a month?

2002 Ziff Davis Smart Business "Five-Star Award" — EarthLink has received the only five star rating among Internet service providers (ISP) from the editors of Ziff Davis Smart Busines. The magazine selected the Atlanta-based ISP as its "top pick," citing EarthLink's easy installation, abundance of local-access dial-up numbers and array of broadband choices including cable, DSL and satellite high-speed access. In a review tided Deathmatch: Internet Service Providers, Gordon Bass writes, "The Net, he way you want it... Remarkably simple to install, and "Fastest time for a 1MB download with a 56Kbps connection."

Ziff Davis Smart Business 5-Star Award Logo is a trademark of Ziff Davis Publishing Holdings Inc.

2001 Mobile Computing's "First Class Award" — They write, "Once again, our First Class Award goes to EarthLink, but not just for providing a fast and reliable connection to the Internet without pop-up ads. This international ISP has rounded out its offerings by adding two origing plans ... and more important, by supporting a wide variety of wireless-access devices."

2000 Mobile Computing's Best ISP Award — Both EarthLink and MindSpring were named test Internet service provider in Mobile Computing's editorial review. "Based on these factors ability to connect to the Internet in a variety of ways and the time it look to connect], two companies which are soon to be one, came out on top."

2001 Interactive Week's "Top Internet Service Provider" Award — For the second year is now, EarthLink was honored with another award from Interactive Week. This year; II nanagers raised EarthLink die "Top Internet Service Provider" in a survey. "No Internet service provider is more deserving of a top spot in the ISP category than EarthLink ... Number one lights hard to become a real alternative to America Online."

2001 Ziff Davis Smart Business' "Best of the Best" Award — Formerly PC Computing, Zift Davis Smart Business Magazine awarded EarthLink its second straight MVP award for best ISP thile EarthLink Biz was named a Web Hosting finalist. The magazine writes "[EarthLink] ... omes in first place for easy access to the Net from just about anywhere in the 50 states ... What lse could you want?"